BARROW'S BIBLIOGRAPHY
OF BIBLIOGRAPHIES
REVIEW AND SUPPLEMENT

WILBUR M. SMITH

ISSUED QUARTERLY BY
THE LIBRARY
Fuller Theological Seminary
PASADENA, CALIFORNIA
CHANGES

According to the dictionary ‘change’ means “to alter by substituting something else, or by giving up for something else; to put or take another or others in place of.” There have been changes around here, alterations and substitutions. Dr. Ehlert who so aptly started and edited our Library Bulletin through 27 numbers is no longer with us. We of the Bulletin staff already miss his wise counsel and careful observance of detail. We are grateful to him for setting up such a fine journal. We hope that future issues may not only reflect his ideals, but go on unto even greater heights.

It is our desire that the Fuller Library Bulletin may be a medium of discussion of library problems and techniques as they pertain particularly to religious libraries; as well as offer bibliographies of such significance that they will make a real contribution as check lists for both libraries and special studies in the subjects covered. We hope the Bulletin will arouse interest in, and discussion of, religious books as well as library problems. We cannot possibly meet this aim alone, so we must needs call on librarians everywhere to help us, and to contribute. We invite your articles, suggestions, and correspondence.

We wish to take this opportunity to extend to Dr. Ehlert our sincere congratulations and heartiest wish for success in his new venture as librarian of Talbot Seminary and the Bible Institute of Los Angeles.

Clara B. Allen

While attempting to evaluate our library program, a questionnaire was sent out to other libraries serving Seminaries the same size as ours. From the responses we have compiled the following comparative evaluation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Seminary</th>
<th>Enrollment</th>
<th>Book Collect.</th>
<th>Prof. Staff</th>
<th>Non-Prof. Staff</th>
<th>Hours per week</th>
<th>Student</th>
<th>No. Books processed last year</th>
<th>Budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>275</td>
<td>30,000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td>3200</td>
<td>$19,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>293</td>
<td>55,000</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
<td>3081</td>
<td>32,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>180,000</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td>2982</td>
<td>29,650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>110,000</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>72</td>
<td></td>
<td>3500</td>
<td>41,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>299</td>
<td>49,250</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
<td>1223</td>
<td>11,850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>210,000</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>190</td>
<td></td>
<td>5391</td>
<td>60,075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>18,000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td>2913</td>
<td>12,625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>27,000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>55</td>
<td></td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>19,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>299</td>
<td>30,000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>95</td>
<td></td>
<td>2150</td>
<td>10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>30,500</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BIBLE ENTRIES

A REPORT

At a recent meeting of the Christian Librarians Association the discussion centered around "Bible Entries" in the dictionary catalogue, especially as Subject headings and their subheads. Most of the Librarians present follow the Library of Congress practice, with minor variations, for BIBLE as the main entry on texts. The main variation here at Fuller is that we put the date last as we are more interested in the version than the chronological or historical approach. All were agreed on the need to make analytics for the translator, editor, and popular title. The agreement ceased, however, when we came to Subject headings, for here there seemed to be quite a bit of divergence among us.

To start the discussion Miss Clara B. Allen gave a brief résumé of the practice at Fuller Theological Seminary bringing out the most obvious departures from Library of Congress and Miss Pettee, such as:

Since we are a Seminary Library our users naturally think of ACTS, ROMANS, PSALMS, etc rather than BIBLE. N.T. ACTS . . . Therefore we have listed ROMANS. COMMENTARIES; ACTS. INTRODUCTIONS; PSALMS. TEXTUAL CRITICISM. To distinguish between biography of a man and his book, the book is always followed by a subhead. Thus a biography of Ezra would be Subject headed under EZRA while a commentary on his book would be under EZRA. COMMENTARIES.

In order to reduce further the number of BIBLE drawers in our catalogue [in a Seminary library using complete Library of Congress headings the number of BIBLE drawers can run into a high percentage of the total] we have tried to use phrases or use the Library of Congress subheads as direct Subject headings. We have tried to make these headings conform to the language and viewpoint of our users.

For example we use

AUTHORITY OF THE BIBLE
MANUSCRIPTS. BIBICAL
MAPS. BIBICAL
MUSIC IN THE BIBLE
MIRACLES

We also use PROPHECY and put the designation (NON-BIBICAL) where needed as most of our material is Biblical prophecy, and our users first look under PROPHECY to find the material.

The questions and suggestions which were raised during the discussion are summarized as follows:

1. For the one scholar who might be trained in the Library of Congress headings we put in cross-references.

2. One school has a separate file called a scripture file and here are Subject headings for each individual book of the Bible or portion thereof, and all the commentaries, introductions, etc. are filed under the name of the Bible book. Another school also uses just the name of the book, but it is filed in the main catalogue — leaving it
up to the student to decide from the title whether it is pertinent to his topic. In this way the student notes everything about the Bible book which the library has.

3. "Are we not forfeiting our teaching ministry if we do not educate our clientele to Library of Congress headings?" If our philosophy of the purpose of the Dictionary catalogue is a tool of discipline then we have lost it. If our philosophy is one that the catalogue is a tool to aid the student in finding what he wants quickly then we are making our tool sharper.

4. "With everything scattered throughout the catalogue wouldn't a scholar be likely to miss some information which is pertinent to his topic if he looks only under one topic, while if everything were listed together under BIBLE he might notice other related topics?" In most theological libraries the topics may be drawers apart, as there are so many subheads under the direct heading BIBLE, that the mass is often confusing. Therefore it doesn't actually follow that a user is likely to "see" related topics any more readily if they start with the word BIBLE or if they are filed separately under headings he might think of. With sufficient "see-also" references, and the user's own knowledge of the topic he usually finds all the material he wants.

5. "Don't you lose a logical sequence by using the subheads as direct heading?" This question is met by the fact that the books are classified on the shelves logically. The Subject headings are merely to help us find a particular subject within the large class in our classification or with some related material in another class. It again boils down to our philosophy of the purpose of the catalogue—is it an index or a table of contents to our library?.

6. "Are we not losing standardization, the "gem" for which we have fought so long?" If we work together as we are doing here this evening, in making our standards less formidable and more "up-to-date", we won't. We are not advocating the overthrow of standard, and leaving Subject headings up to the whimsy of individual catalogers, but we are hoping for a revision of old standards which now have to be given crutches so to-day's students can find information.

Questions asked of Librarians across the country who use Library of Congress headings (without variations) prove that folks, even scholars, have trouble finding Bible materials through their catalogues. It puts a heavy burden on the reference librarian, and thus defeats one of the purposes of our catalogue — to enable the searcher to find his own material quickly. A letter from the General Department and Bibliography Division of the Library of Congress indicates that even there "... the general users of the library have difficulty with the file but that some of the Bible students, once they have used it and have become familiar with the order and arrangement [after being trained] seem to have very little difficulty with it, while there are certain other students that never do grasp the arrangement."

The letter goes on to state that there is a need. "Any orderly simplification, if possible, would be welcome ... no library committee interested in revising filing rules has attempted to venture in the Bible field in recent years." Surely the group to "venture" into the Bible field should be theological librarians. Do you have suggestions? "Since there is such a voluminous amount of literature on the Bible, and more each year, a systematic organization of this material must follow some consistent and set pattern." Is Library of Congress system the best or can theological librarians set up a more usable [from the readers' point of view] and up-to-date standard?
The Philosophy and Religion Department of the Los Angeles Public Library was established as a separate department and began its service to the public on October 4, 1927, with a book stock, transferred from the General Literature Department, of 16,000 books and 140 periodicals. It now has, in 1955, a book stock of approximately 54,000 books and 250 periodicals.

POLICIES AND OBJECTIVES

A primary objective of the department is to provide current books, journals and periodicals of significance in the fields of psychology, philosophy and religion, for reference, research and general reading. Paralleling this is the aim of building a well-rounded representative collection of historical and background materials in each field, realizing always that a public library has not the same obligations as a University or Theological library to provide for specialized and scholarly research.

In carrying out these objectives it is necessary to keep in mind that Los Angeles is a very extensive city covering many varieties of population, with two major universities, many Junior and small colleges, and other private educational organizations within its environs. It is a city of many religions, including international groups, small sects and many cults. It, perhaps, has a greater percentage of "fringe groups" than any other city in the United States. Carrying out the obligations of a public library in such a city necessitates providing carefully selected and representative collections for any significant group. It also requires the acquisition of resource material for historical purposes in even the most doubtful areas.

PUBLICS SERVED AND USAGE

The department serves a wide range of publics — from the most light and superficial reader to the serious thinker and scholar who reads the most advanced and technical materials. Perhaps the most representative users of the department are the ordinary laymen who come to get books of inspirational reading, or psychological help. These are the regular readers of the popularly described "inspirational literature", Norman Vincent Peale being a representative author. They also include readers of "metaphysical books", which terms, in the mind of the inquirer, may cover anything from Mind Science, Unity, Theosophy, Rosicrucianism, Occultism, to the Bhagavadgita and Upanishads. They are often members of "Metaphysical study groups", and read the works of a particular teacher, such as Bailes, Holes, Neville, Goddard, Joel Goldsmith, Emmet Fox, Krishnamurti and others.

The next most representative group would be the college students who come for texts and supplementary reading in psychology, ethics or logic; the works of the philosophers, Plato, Aristotle, Aquinas, Spinoza, Nietzsche and others; or the students of religion who come for Biblical materials of all kinds; for theology, pastoral and church work, denominational and comparative religions. While this group reads in every field their requests tend to be channeled toward definitely assigned materials, and demand generally exceeds supply.

Ministers use the department to supplement their own bibliographic resources, or come to browse and select from the new and current books. Other readers include just people; people who
are getting married, and need marriage
and etiquette handbooks; young people,
who want help with personality problems;
church women, who want to prepare a
group worship program.

The department circulated 113,276
books in 1954-55. This was a gain of
5,447 over the previous year, as well as
being the largest circulation gain for the
Alford, Henry, Greek Testament 4v.—
1894-95
Expositor's Greek Testament, edited by
Robertson Nicoll 5v. — 1897
Legg, S.C.C. Novum Testamentum
Graece, on Matthew and Mark 2v. —
1935 which brings the critical text
and apparatus of the New Testament
down to date.
Beautifully printed Bibles include that
typographical masterpiece of all time, the
Dove Press Bible 4v. 1901, as well as the
more recent Bruce Rogers Bible 1949.

There is excellent material on the
transmission of the Bible, its codices and
manuscripts including:
Copinger, W. The Bible and its trans-
mission. 1897
Kenyon, F. G. Facsimiles of Bible
Manuscripts in the Brit-
ish Museum. 1900
Gaston, M. Hebrew illuminated manu-
scripts IX and X cen-
turies. 1901
Burrows, M. The Dead Sea scrolls. 1954

Apocrypha and Apocryphal literature is
well represented and greatly read. The
collection includes Charles, R. H., Apo-
crypha and Pseudpigrapha of the Old
Testament in English 2v. 1913

Bible dictionaries, concordances and
commentaries make up a large part of the
Biblical reference materials. A check of
Wilbur Smith's recent bibliography (Full-
Bibliography of Biblical, Ecclesiastical
and Theological Dictionaries, which in-
cludes some two hundred titles, many of
them very old, showed approximately one
fourth of the titles represented in the
collection including:
Blunt, J.H., Dictionary of sects, heresies
and schools of thought.
1891
Encyclopedia Biblica 4v. — 1899

Kitto, John. Cyclopedia of Biblical lit-
terature 2v. — 1845. Among the rarer con-
cordances is the two volume Hatch and
Redpath Concordance to the Septuagint
and including the Apocrypha, 1897. Com-
mentaries include many well known sets
such as the popularly named Matthew
Henry Commentary, 1863, the Interna-
tional Critical, 1910, Clarke's Commen-
tary, n.d., and the great 49-volume Ex-
positor's Bible, 1888-1899.

Central Library, and tangible proof of the
growing interest and use of the materials
in this field. It is interesting, however, to
note the somewhat inverse relation of
book collection to circulation. Book stock
in religion is almost double that in Phi-
losophy and Psychology but its circulation
is only a little more than two thirds as
large. This can be partially accounted for
by the far greater reference collection in
Religion, but there definitely is greater
usage in the Psychology, Philosophy and
general Ethics materials. These subjects
are also far more widely represented and
used in the Branch collections. The Cen-
tral Library collection supplies many
branch requests in both fields through a
very functional inter-library loan system.
Owing to the fact that much of the litera-
ture in these fields cannot be purchased
by smaller libraries we are also widely be-
coming a resource library for many state
wide requests.

BOOK COLLECTION — RELIGION

An examination of the collection re-
veals that patterns of growth and use do
not vary greatly over the years. Biblical
literature continues to be the largest seg-
ment of the collection, and also represent
the greater portion of the reference col-
collection. The Bible collection contains cir-
culating and reference copies of all the
important and representative translations
and editions. It also includes many im-
portant older Bibles, early editions of the
Latin Vulgate, the Septuagint, Wycliffe,
Tyndale, Luther and others. Some of the
rarer items include:

Walton’s Biblia Sacra Polyglotta, 6v. —
1655-57.
The most accurate and best equipped of
the great Polyglots which includes
Hebrew, Latin, Greek, Chaldean,
Ethiopic and Persian versions of the
Bible.
English Hexapla, 1846
Provides in parallel columns the Wyckliffe, Tyndale, Cranmer, Genevan, Douai and King James versions.

Up-to-date Greek New Testaments are supplemented by many important and valuable older versions including:

* Vetus Testamentum ex Versione Septuaginta 4v. — 1730-32
* Tischendorf, C. Novum Testamentum Graece 3v. — 1869

Christian literature—theology, apologetics, and church history — includes source materials from the early Apostolic Fathers to the great modern theologians. Complete sets of Ante-Nicene, Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers provide the full story of the many schools of early Christian faith, the struggles with heresies, and the development of creeds. The reformation era and the development of the Christian denominations is well represented and includes the lives and works of the early reformers—Zwingli, Wycliffe, Luther, Knox, Calvin, Wesley and others; as well as John Foxe’s Book of Martyrs and his 8-volume Acts and Monuments. Excellent historical materials for the many religious denominations trace their origins from European foundings to their establishment in America, and their place in religion today. Sets representative of these early works include:

* Edwards, Jonathan, Works, 8 v. — 1808-09.
* Dwight, Timothy, Theology, 4 v. — 1825.

Just as the early Church had its sects and heresies, so modern Christianity finds itself confronted by cults. Perhaps no library in the country has as complete a collection of information about, and literature of these cults. Situated as we are in the heart of this great non-conformist city we glean and cull from this material taking particular thought of historical source materials for the future. Modern writers in this field such as Charles Braden and others use our materials on Jehovah’s Witnesses, Father Divine, Moral Rearmament, Vedanta, Christian Science, Unity and New Thought. Pamphlets, clippings and sample magazines are used to keep these files up-to-date and as comprehensive as possible.

Perhaps no literature of the past has as great popularity in the present as does medieval mysticism. The collection is rich in the works of these religious great: Bernard of Clairvaux, Meister Eckhart, Johanna of Norwich, Henry Susso, Tauler, Ruysbroeck and Thomas à Kempis; and of the Post-Reformation mystics—Jacob Boehme, Miguel de Molinos, Madame de Guyon, Juan de la Cruz, Theresa of Avila, Pascal, Fenelon and William Law. Modern mystics such as Evelyn Underhill, Simone Weil and Thomas Merton continue the tradition and compete for reader attention.

The church in the world, its administration, liturgies, worship services, pastoral work and ecumenical endeavors is an area of growing publication and interest, and its materials, historical and current, are kept up-to-date. Paralleling the increased interest in psychology a new literature of pastoral psychology and counseling is developing. The department takes a keen interest in this collection.

Non-Christian religions are well represented in the collection with works of historical background as well as the sacred literatures. Max Muller, Sacred Books of the East, 50 v., is in daily use and a rather full collection of general works on comparative religions provide simple summaries for the cursory investigator, and the hard pressed student. Picard, Ceremonies et Coutumes, religieuses de tous des peuples du monde, 1807-1810, is a wonderful old work in 12 volumes and provides profuse and excellent copper plate illustrations together with the history of even the more obscure and primitive groups.

The largest single non-Christian religion in the collection is the material on Judaism. Many important reference works supply source materials for the study of this group. Included in the collection are the fine publications of the great Soncino Press, the Babylonian Talmud, 34 v., the Zohar, 5 v., the Soncino Bible, 14 v. Two copies of the 350-copy edition of Myer’s Qabbalah are held...
by the department. Two gift collections, The Lerner and The Edelman collections, consist of some 250 titles, most of them in Hebrew.

BOOK COLLECTION — PHILOSOPHY

The 100 collection can be divided into four major subject groups; philosophy, psychology, ethics and metaphysical subjects. The most popular subject is general metaphysics which is closely allied with religion, and much of the material is represented by mind science, psychic research and occult subjects.

Psychology continues to expand as a subject field, and the department has an excellent collection, including the major work of Freud, Jung, Adler, Rank and Horney as well as the more popular works of Kunkel, Hiltner, Overstreet, Travis and others.

Philosophy is of course a major subject and is growing in general popularity. The works of Plato, Aristotle and Thomas Aquinas are represented by complete works and major editions for reference and loan. All of the ranking great philosophers of Europe, Asia and the Americas are represented. There are few gaps in the collection and these are being filled as rapidly as editions are available for purchase. A growing collection of materials in logic belongs with this group.

Present-day ethics, etiquette and materials on morals comprise the remainder of this collection. Representative and important books on marriage, Christian ethics, or such subjects as Jewish, and suffering, suicide, alcoholism, and the general problems of living in today's world make this an important and popularly used section of the collection.

SPECIAL COLLECTIONS

The two Hebrew collections Lerner and Edelman plus a collection of fine old books in skin and vellum bindings, many of them religious publications of early California and the Puebla de Los Angeles, and 44 titles published before 1700 and primarily in Spanish, constitute the special collections of the department.

INDEXES AND INFORMATION FILES

A number of special indexes for reference work have been developed by the department. They are kept up-to-date and periodically revised. The most used are the Los Angeles Church Directory by denominations; Hymns by titles and first lines; Sermons by text; and Catholic books by classification. Other special files include ethics and superstition indexes by subject, and a mythology index of gods and goddesses by attribute. A biography index is in progress.

PERIODICAL FILES

A subject breakdown by the 250 magazines in the department reveals some interesting facts. There are 21 Catholic periodicals and 21 classed as non-sectarian. The 9 Bible titles, 19 Missions, and 19 Theology titles come from all denominations. There are 10 Jewish, and between 5 and 6 titles for each of the major denominations. There are 25 periodicals devoted to serious philosophy and 26 which cover psychology and psychoanalysis. Some of our older and more complete files include:

- Arminian Magazine 1778 change to Methodist Magazine 1798-1899.
- Christian Observer, 1802-1877.
- Methodist Review, 1824+ incomplete.
- Christian Examiner, 1824-1865.
- Bibliotheca Sacra, v. 1, 1834+.
- Catholic World, v. 1, 1865+.
- International Journal of Ethics, v. 1, 1890+.
- Psychological Review, v. 1, 1894+.

Important serial publications in all fields are purchased, representative items being:

- Yearbook of American Churches.
- Catholic Almanac.
- American Jewish Yearbook
- Archives of Psychology
- Psychological Monographs

The department continues to grow in popularity and use. Its subject fields become more important to people in these days of stress and the increasing knowledge of the need for unity in all our affairs.
BARROW'S BIBLIOGRAPHY OF BIBLIOGRAPHIES IN RELIGION
Review and Supplement

WILBUR M. SMITH

After more than a quarter of a century of labor, Dr. John Graves Barrow has issued (lithoprinted) his monumental Bibliography of Bibliographies in Religion (Edwards Brothers, Ann Arbor, Mich., 1955) pp. xi, 489, double columns, 11 x 8½ inches. In 1930, Dr. Barrow received his Ph.D. degree at Yale University, upon completing an exhaustive list of the bibliographies of missions, in which he gathered materials from extensive travel made possible by a fellowship from the Sterling Fund. This bibliography, now enlarged to include religion in general, is the result of constant labor since that time, including, as Dr. Barrow says in the Preface, “two years spent in the Library of Congress.” For nearly ten years, beginning in 1916, Dr. Barrow was an instructor and librarian in Lingnan University, Canton, China; from 1926-1930, librarian in charge of the Day Missions Library of the Divinity School of Yale University; from 1931-1933, Classifier in Theology in the Yale University Library, and for the following ten years, librarian at Berea College, Kentucky. No one could have better opportunities than these for doing such a work. The result is the most comprehensive bibliography of bibliographies in the field of religion that has ever appeared in our own language. This task, in toto, will never need to be undertaken again, though numerous additions—as we shall soon see—would make a second edition even more valuable.

From a quick glance over the contents one observes that the Roman Catholic Church is given as much space as the entire subject of Church History, and twice as much space as the thirty different subjects under Miscellaneous Topics. This I think, is not due to any pro-Catholic leaning by Dr. Barrow, but to the fact—to the embarrassment of Protestants—that the Catholic Church has given a great deal more attention to bibliographical works and reading lists than has the Protestant Church. The bibliography proper is followed by an appendix (9 columns) of titles which have come to the attention of the compiler, “copies of which works were not found, nor was their existence verified.” Here is an area in which one who enjoys bibliography, and has some leisure, could go to work.

What really surprises me in this rather exhaustive analysis of the contents of the book is that there is not one single division devoted to Theology; in fact, there is no section here for Christology! It is true that “Jesus Christ” is assigned a section, but this is in the larger division devoted to bibliographies of about 180 individuals, Jesus Christ appearing between Jeanne d’Arc and Rufus M. Jones. Under Miscellaneous Topics, there is a section for “Atheism, Free Thought, Skepticism,” but not for Theism. While Dr. Barrow devotes three full columns to works on The Imitation of Christ, he does not choose to assign such subjects as the Virgin Birth of Christ, the Deity of Christ, the Resurrection of Christ, the Second Advent of Christ, or the Incarnation. Dr. Barrow must have had some reason for deliberately refraining from working out a bibliography under the general heading of Theology, inasmuch as theological literature has had such an enormous influence in the history of the Christian Church but no hint of what this reason might be is to be found in these pages. In the classifications of this work there are thus some serious lacunae.

The bibliographical titles which appear at the beginning of Calmet’s vast
Bibliotheca Sacra, have always fascinated me. This work was originally compiled in 1722, and lists many volumes very difficult to come upon. Calmet devotes practically two entire columns to the Bibliotheca Sancta of Sextus of Siena, issued in the middle of the sixteenth century (even Calmet has two spellings for this scholar, Sextus and Sixtus). One generally looks in vain for this name, even in the Catholic Encyclopedia, but upon opening Barrow's work, I was pleased to find more material on Sextus than is contained in Calmet's account of 230 years ago—two and one-third columns in Barrow giving the full elaborate Latin titles of six different editions from 1575-1626. This complicated bibliographical matter probably had never been fully untangled, at least in any English work, before Barrow began to investigate the subject. He has done a good piece of work here.

Continuing with Calmet for a moment, I would like to quote a brief paragraph from his list of Protestant bibliographies: "Wendler, another German Lutheran, in 1721, published the Essay of a Bibliotheca Sacra, with the title of Prodromus Bibliothecae Sacrae, wherein he gives us his own Judgment, and that of others, upon every Author. This Work is in very great Esteem; and, notwithstanding all the Search I made for it in Paris, was never to be found there." I rather eagerly turned to Barrow to see if he might have Wendler's book listed. It is here in full, with a Latin title of twelve lines, a work of 456 pages published in 1721 at Jena, of which Barrow says, "a discussion of much material of bibliographical interest." Our learned compiler found two copies, one in the Zentralbibliothek in Zurich, Switzerland, and another at Yale University.

GENERAL BIBLIOGRAPHY

Probably the best method for surveying the contents of this volume would be to take subjects in their order, though some of them cannot be considered here. The first forty pages are devoted to general bibliographies of religion. The most surprising omission here is that of the greatest bibliography of Biblical and theological literature issued in the English language down to the time of Horne's Manual of Biblical Bibliography (1839), namely, the concluding volume of the first major Bible dictionary to be published, Augustin Calmet's Historical, Critical, Geographical... Dictionary of the Holy Bible, originally published in French, Paris, 1722, appearing in English in three folio volumes, six parts (London, 1732), the last volume of which bears the title, "Bibliotheca Sacra; Or, a Catalog of the Best Books that Can be Read in Order to Acquire a Good Understanding of the Scriptures." There are over two thousand authors named in the index to this work, and I would estimate that Calmet has given us here a bibliography, of both Catholic and Protestant literature, on every conceivable Biblical subject, embracing between eight and nine thousand titles! Many of these works cannot be found anywhere in the western world today. A superb doctoral thesis could be produced from a careful study of Calmet's bibliography, with his most interesting notes. All of this Dr. Barrow has strangely passed by, though the work stood as the most significant Biblical bibliography in the English language down to near the middle of the nineteenth century.

In the Preface to his work, Dr. Barrow says, "The following are outside the limits of this work as a rule: (1) bibliographies appended to books and to articles in journals and encyclopedias, (2) dictionaries, encyclopedias and manuals." The most important part of this statement is the phrase, "as a rule," for Dr. Barrow continually breaks the rule. He has a number of references to periodical articles, which makes his bibliographies all the more complete, and often inserts extended notices of books which he acknowledges are not strictly bibliographical, e.g., the work edited by Gerald Birney Smith, A Guide to the Study of the Christian Religion (Chicago, 1917), of which he says, "This is not, strictly speaking, a bibliography; it contains discussions on literature in the various fields."

PERIODICALS

The most serious omission in the division of periodicals is that of the invaluable Index to the Expository Times, Vols.
I-XX, 1889-1909, published by T. and T. Clark of Edinburgh about 1910, which has been of the greatest help to Biblical and theological students in their research. What a boon it would be if someone should now undertake the compiling of an index to the forty-six subsequent volumes! (One reason Dr. Barrow may have missed this is that it is not in the magnificent work by Haskell, *A Check List of Cumulative Indexes to Individual Periodicals in the New York Public Library*, 1942).

In addition, there should be included the carefully compiled index to the first 21 volumes of the *Lutheran Church Quarterly*, published as the first issue of Vol. XXII of this journal, January, 1949. There is also an index to the first 24 volumes of the *American Journal of Theology*, 1897-1920, in Vol. XXIV, pp. 529-629; a separately-published index to *The Biblical Repertory*, covering all issues from 1825-1866 (Philadelphia, 1871), a work of 556 pages; an index to the first 28 volumes of *The Biblical World*, 1893-1906, in Vol. XXVIII of that journal, pp. 433-526; two indexes to the first forty volumes of *The Journal of Biblical Literature*, 1881-1921, in Vols. XX and XI; and a separately-published index of Vols. XLII-LX, 1922-1941, Philadelphia, 1942, pp. 72. Incidentally, Dr. Barrow lists his Indexes to *The Expositor* here, where it belongs, but in the section devoted to Bible—General.

Our compiler has labored for weeks, if not months, in an attempt to draw up a fairly complete list of the published catalogs of libraries which are principally Biblical or theological, and he has done a splendid piece of work indeed. Among those omitted, I am aware of the following: *Catalogue of the Library of the Theological College of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church in England* (London, 1871); *Catalogue of the Books both Manuscript and Printed, which are Preserved in the Library of Christ Church, Canterbury* (1802); *Catalogue of the Cathedral Library of Canterbury*; and *E. A. Savage, Notes on the Early Monastic Libraries of Scotland*, with an account of the Registrum Librorum Anglieae, and of the *Catalogus Scriptorum Ecclesiae of John Boston of the Abbey of Bury St. Edmunds*, (Edinburgh, 1928).

**DEALER CATALOGS**

Here again Dr. Barrow has tirelessly sought to untangle the confusion that has gathered around the complicated subject of catalogs of theological literature issued by booksellers in Great Britain and America, etc. He has given particular attention to those marvelous catalogues, the like of which we shall probably never see again, distributed by C. J. Stewart, the London bookseller. To Dr. Barrow’s list, I would like to add the following from my own collection of the Stewart catalogs: *A Catalogue of the Fathers of the Church and Ecclesiastical Writers to the Fifteenth Century, Arranged in Chronological Order*, London, 1840, pp. 54. (915 items, with index); *C. J. Stewart’s Catalogue, Part I: Foreign Theology. Part II: English Theology*, London, 1840, pp. 228 (5559 items); *C. J. Stewart’s Catalogue of Some Recent Purchases, Being a Second Supplement to His General Catalogue*, London, 1848, pp. 112 (1517 items); *Ecclesiastical Law and Polity: a Catalogue of Works on Canon and Later Ecclesiastical Law, Church Government, Discipline, etc. Including Jewish law and polity*, London, n.d., pp. 72 (1121 items); *Third Supplement to C. J. Stewart’s Catalogue of the Writers of the Sixteenth and Later Centuries*, London, 1863, pp. 121 (1418 items); *A General Catalogue of the Stock of C. J. Stewart*, 1880. Of the catalogs of D. Nutt, at least one is omitted: *A Catalogue of Foreign Theology Comprising the Holy Scriptures in Various Languages . . . A Choice and Valuable Collection of Literature and Missals . . . the Fathers of the Church . . . the Council of Trent, etc.*, London, 1837, pp. 372 (4024 items).

One wonders where the line should be drawn in listing these booksellers’ catalogs. I can remember when, as a young man, just beginning to buy theological books, the catalogs of R. D. Dickinson on Farrington Street, London, were just about the finest that came to my study. On my first trip to London, in 1925, I went to visit these people and found a five-story building and basement stacked with theological works. One bomb in the second World War destroyed 200,000 volumes. Blackwell’s Ltd., has issued some outstanding catalogs not recorded here. Two catalogs which should
have been included in this list are those issued by A. Rosenthal, Ltd., of Oxford: Catalogue II, *Judaica and Hebraica Before 1815*, from the Libraries of the Late Chief Rabbi Dr. J. H. Hertz, C.H., E. N. Adler, and Other Great Collectors, Oxford, 1948, pp. 48 (629 items); and Catalogue XIV, *Bible, Hebrew Studies and Rabbinics (1816-1948)* from the Libraries of the Late Chief Rabbi Dr. J. H. Hertz, C.H., E. N. Adler, Dr. A. Büchler and Other Well-Known Scholars, Oxford, 1949, pp. 48 (1439 items). In our own country, the Bloch Publishing Co. has printed some very interesting lists, two of which are before me: *A Catalogue of English Judaica Containing Every Book in Print of General Jewish Interest*, New York, 1931, pp. 78, the cover of which bears the statement, “It is the only list of its kind issued in the world by the oldest Jewish publishing house in America.” The second, issued in 1933, is entitled, *Catalogue No. II, English Judaica*, pp. 39. An important catalog of many years ago, so significant that it was listed in the catalog of the Princeton Seminary Library, is *The Catalogue and Specimen Book of Oxford and Polyglott Bibles, Works in Theology and Miscellaneous Literature*: published by C. B. Bagster and C. S. Marshall, Philadelphia (London, n.d.).

Duckett of London some time ago issued *A Short Title English Liturgical Bibliography*, assembled by Graham Jenkins, which “proposes to direct students to the existing books on the subject in English,” pp. 16. In 1931, the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge published a remarkable catalog simply called *General Catalog, 1931*, listing the publications of the S. P. C. K. and the Sheldon Press. pp. 217.

The catalogs of the Sion College and Library should be supplemented by *The Sion College and Library*, by E. H. Pearce, Cambridge, 1913, pp. 375.

**RECENT BIBLIOGRAPHIES OMITTED**

In the matter of omissions, there is an ignoring of the splendid bibliographies recently issued by Princeton Theological Seminary, none of which I am able to find listed here. They are *A Bibliography of Bible Study for Theological Students* (1948) pp. 85; Bibliography of Systematic Theology for Theological Students (1949) pp. 44; and Bibliography of Practical Theology (1949) pp. 71.

There is no indication in Dr. Barrow’s work as to when he ceased revising his pages before they were put into litho-print form. The last date in the bibliography on Bibles is 1948. Let me therefore list here, as a supplement to Barrow, a few items here on my desk, without trying to discover a number in other bibliographical works.


**A Guide to Christian Reading.** London: Inter-Varsity Fellowship, 1952. In my opinion, this is the most important bibliography of Biblical and theological material of our generation constructed from a conservative viewpoint. Almost 1500 volumes are listed, with author, title, publisher, date, and sometimes page numbers, with an occasional brief word of comment. The material is well classified under 58 headings, arranged under 9 major divisions.

**List of Books for Theological Libraries.** Prepared by a number of educators in this country and put together by Professor Terrelle B. Crum of the Providence Bible Institute. 141 quarto pages.

**Theological Bibliographies, in Andover-Newton Bulletin, April, 1951, pp. 31.** This was separately published.

**A Basic Theological Bibliography for Ministers, Selected and Annotated by the Faculty of Union Theological Seminary.** New York, 1952, pp. 57. Reprinted from *Union Seminary Quarterly Review*.


**Church, State and Education: Select Bibliography.** American Jewish Committee, 1951. pp. 24.
Perhaps Dr. Barrows has not seen the Fuller Library Bulletin, which, since its first publication in 1949, has carried what are recognized as worthwhile bibliographies, including "A Bibliography of the Influence of the Bible on English Literature," by W. M. Smith, January—June, 1951, pp. 15; "An Annotated Bibliography of the History of Theology from Schleiermacher Till 1951," by Bernard Ramm, July—December, 1952, pp. 14; "Some Recently Published (1950-1952) Bibliographies in Books of Biblical Interpretation, Theology, and Church History," by W. M. Smith, January—June, 1953, pp. 30, which represents, as far as I know, the only attempt made to compile a fairly complete list of all the Bible dictionaries published in the English language since that of Thomas Wilson in 1612.

THE BIBLIOGRAPHY OF BIOGRAPHIES

In forty pages, the compiler lists bibliographies for 185 individuals, of whom eight were still living when the work was in process of construction. Many have only one title assigned to them; the Virgin Mary and Swedenborg have 13 each, and Martin Luther, 51. Some of these names are comparatively unimportant. Evidently Dr. Barrow did not search out bibliographies of the more prominent men and women in the field of religion, but, rather, listed all the bibliographies he found of men and women who had, for the most part, made contributions to religious literature. There are some serious omissions here. No bibliography of Dante is referred to, though the British Museum has separately issued the Dante section of its printed catalogue. Under Thomas á Kempis should there be added J. E. De Montmorency: Thomas á Kempis, His Age and His Books. The list of the writings of Shirley Jackson Case, reprinted from the Journal of Religion, January, 1949, should be here. The bibliographies of Mary Baker Eddy have been ignored. The tremendous bibliography of Calvin’s Institutes deserves a place in this list. My own work, Dwight L. Moody: An Annotated Bibliography, (1946) the most comprehensive bibliography of any religious leader in America, is not included. In the list of works on Martin Luther, a very important volume has been overlooked, Luther’s German Bible, by M. Reu (1934) with vast bibliographies. Inasmuch as occasionally in other places in this volume, titles are given of books which only contain bibliographies, Dr. Barrow could have given a little more attention to the more extensive lists to be found in the lives of outstanding Christian authors, e.g., the eight pages at the conclusion of Brooke Foss Westcott’s Life and Letters, and the indispensable writings of Philip Schaff in the biography of this distinguished church historian by his son.


In the light of the clear evidence of Dr. Barrow’s taking such infinite pains with the literature of some areas of theological bibliography, especially the rarer works of the seventeenth century, it is nothing less than amazing to find glaring omissions in the bibliography of literature concerning Christ. A notable piece of work in this area is Leben Jesu-Werk, by I. Neyenberg, published in three volumes in Luzern, 1925-1926, extending to 703 pages. This is a Roman Catholic work, but is indispensable for such a study. In 1947 Jean G. H. Hoffmann issued his Les Vies De Jesus et Le Jesus De L’Histoire, pp. vi, 232, which forms Vol. XVII of Acta Seminarii Neotestamentici Upsaliensis Edenda Curavit A. Fridrichsen. Practically the entire issue of the Harvard Theological Review for October, 1929, is devoted to a strictly bibliographical study, “From Locke to Reitzenstein: the Historical Investigation of the Origins of Christianity,” by Luigi Salvatorelli, Vol. XXII, pp. 363-370. This was supplemented in 1934 by an article by E. F. Scott, “Recent Lives of Jesus,” Vol.
I. APOLOGETICS

In the field of apologetics, Dr. Barrow should have included a volume which had wide influence when originally published, and the added distinction of being the first bibliography in its field to be issued in this country, as well as one of the most elaborate in any area of religion: Hannah Adams (1755-1831): Truth and Excellence of the Christian Religion, in two parts, pp. 384, (1804) Part I carries the subtitle, “Sketches of the Lives of Eminent Laymen Who Have Written in Defense of the Christian Religion.” Here are short biographies of sixty well-known writers of the sixteenth, seventeenth, and eighteenth centuries, with titles of many of their works. An earlier volume, now quite scarce, is Claude Francis Houteville: A Critical and Historical Discourse Upon the Method of the Principle Authors Who Wrote For and Against Christianity From Its Beginning, Eng. tr., London, 1739.

The bibliography of Catholic literature in this work is amazingly thorough, but Dr. Barrow has missed at least two rather valuable items: John Tracy Ellis: A Select Bibliography of the History of the Catholic Church in the United States, New York, 1947, pp 96; and Sister Mary Anselm Langenderfer: An Annotated Study of Catholic Lives of Christ Published in the United States, Catholic University of America, 1940, 93 numbered leaves; an unpublished typewritten thesis.

In the section devoted to the Bible in France and French versions, the standard work is strangely passed by—Histoire de la Bible en France, by D. Lortsch, Paris, 1910, pp. xxiii, 590. The list of catalogs of Bible exhibitions seems quite complete, but I do not see here the Catalogue of an Exhibition of the English Bible, 1535-1935, at the Lockwood Memorial Library, University of Buffalo, Buffalo, New York, 1936, 19 unnumbered pages.

Because great emphasis is placed upon missions some reference should have been made to the Catalog of the American Press of the Board of Foreign Missions of the Presbyterian Church in the U. S. A. Celebrating One Hundred Years in Arabic Publication. Beirut, Syria, 1934, pp. vii, 73.

Inasmuch as Dr. Barrow has felt led to list such a work as Krüger’s History of Early Christian Literature in the First Three Centuries, he should have mentioned others of equal bibliographic importance, e.g., F. Cayre: Manual of Patrology and History of Theology, Eng. tr. 2 vols., Paris and Rome, 1935; Pierre De Labriolle: History and Literature of Christianity from Tertullian to Boethius, Eng. tr., New York, 1925; Abbé Bardy: The Christian Latin Literature of the First Six Centuries, London, 1930; Johannes Quasten: Patrology, Westminster, Md.: Newman Press, Vol. I, 1941, Vol. II, 1945. These last two volumes begin a series that is to cover the entire history of the Church Fathers. The bibliographies are the most exhaustive that have appeared in our language, and this will for years be the standard guide, in English, to the vast subject of patristic literature.

II. MISCELLANEOUS ADDITIONS

While my field is certainly not eighteenth century German bibliography—and Dr. Barrow has done a superb piece of work in this area—I believe one work of importance has been omitted, namely, Stengel: Apparatus Librorum Theologorum. Ulm, 1724.

One of the greatest book-sale catalogs in the area of theology for the early eighteenth century has been overlooked by Dr. Barrow: Baier, Joh. Wil.: Catalogus Librorum Theologicorum . . . selectorum atque rariorum quibus suam olim Bibliothecam B. Io. Guil. Baierus . . . instruxerat nunc autem singuli ven­ eunt auctionis ritu distrahendi. Altdorf, 1731. 2 ff., pp. 640. This enormous theological library was offered for sale in some six thousand lots.

It seems to me that since the idea of a bibliographical list actually appears in the title of this work, the following title belongs here: Augustus Herman Franck: Guide to the Reading and Study of the Holy Scriptures Translated from the Latin and Augmented with . . . a
Copious but Select List of the Most Valuable Commentaries and Biblical Works, exhibiting also on each book the criticisms of able divines, by William Jaques. 3d ed., London, 1819; bibliography, pp. 231-296.


One of the most important manuscript bibliographies of the nineteenth century is the catalogue of Patristic manuscripts in the Italian libraries, compiled by A. Reifferscheid, Bibliotheca Patrum Latinorum Italica. Vienna, 1865-1872. 2 vols. in 9 parts, pp. 591, 436.


Cornelis van der Spek: The Church and the Churchman in English Dramatic Literature Before 1642. Amsterdam, 1930.


Hubert Box (Ed.): The Priest as Student. London, 1939. pp. 380. Excellent chapters by British theologians on various theological disciplines, with adequate bibliographies.

The section on the library, by Dr. A. Mitchell Hunter in New College, Edinburgh, a Centenary History, Edinburgh, 1946, should have a place in any comprehensive bibliography of theological literature, for it contains a complete list (pp. 212-260) of all the separately-published works of the principals, deans and professors that have been identified with New College for the past one hundred years.

While strictly speaking it belongs in the area of philology, the recently-published bibliography of my colleague Dr. William Sanford LaSor presents a much-needed list of the better grammars, lexicons, etc., relating to ancient Semitic languages which bear directly upon the interpretation of the Old Testament, A Basic Semitic Bibliography, Wheaton, Ill., 1950. pp. viii, 56.

Inasmuch as there are many very brief bibliographies in Dr. Barrow's study, he might also have included the ten important lists, "Recommended Books for Use in the Closely-Graded Lesson Series," one each for different periods from six to sixteen years of age, prepared by Mrs. W. B. Kelly and Frances Lee, published by the Baptist Sunday School Board of Nashville, Tenn. As far as I know, this is the most elaborate bibliographical work for Sunday Schools now in circulation, and it will no doubt have extensive influence.

A very interesting work still in manuscript form is the catalog of Colonel Grant's Bible Collection in the library of the University of Chicago, which lists approximately three hundred different Bibles.

Certainly the School Library Review (London) Easter Term, 1914, should be given space here, since the entire issue, designated the Scripture Number, is devoted to Biblical and theological bibliographies. Inasmuch as Dr. Barrow, as we have noted, sometimes lists books that only contain bibliographies, a few more of unusual merit could have been added, such as that quite exhaustive catalog of rationalism in J. H. Hurst: History of Rationalism, 1865, pp. 590-606, and the remarkable list of nearly three hundred works on the crucifixion of our Lord, and the Cross, in William Seymour: The Cross in Tradition, History and Art, 1898, pp. xxi-xxx. The section on Deism could be improved by reference to the scholarly volumes by Morais, Warren, etc., on Deism, and Free Thought, in America, published by Columbia University Press, which carry elaborate bibliographies.

There is one major regrettable feature about this exhaustive work which ought never to characterize any general bibliographical undertaking, unless it is so indicated in the title or preface, namely, a
strong antipathy toward conservative efforts in the field of bibliography. An illustration of this is found in Dr. Barrow's treatment of a tiny pamphlet of fifteen pages (actually only eight pages of bibliography) by Dr. W. H. Griffith-Thomas, published by the Sunday School Times in 1921. To this, then not too important and now long forgotten, work, he assigns nearly one-half column, four inches of small type, or as much space as is allotted to the three greatest theological bibliographies of the nineteenth century, that by Horne in 1839, the classified volume by Darling in 1859, and the indispensable work by Hurst in 1896—I repeat, three truly outstanding bibliographies, totaling over 2100 pages, are given the same amount of space as is this little pamphlet by Dr. Griffith-Thomas, the conservative leanings of which are unfolded in detail by Dr. Barrow. Concerning my own volume, Profitable Bible Study, (the revised edition of which is not here listed) Dr Barrow adds the note, "Definitely 'conservative' in point of view." There are other similar remarks here and there in this volume. Nowhere does he say that a work is definitely "liberal." This has been characteristic of Dr. Barrow's bibliographical labors for years. It is one thing for him to express himself as against conservative literature in correspondence, but all conservatives, and liberals alike, will regret that this animus is so manifest in this compilation.

No one has so thoroughly worked through the libraries of America and Great Britain, as well as the continent of Europe, for theological bibliography as has Dr. Barrow, which leads me to ask a question. In Reginald Arthur Rye's exhaustive volume, The Student's Guide to the Libraries of London (3d ed., 1927) the index, under "Theology", lists fifty-six libraries in the city of London alone as being theologically significant. Of this, I find that Dr. Barrow has inserted literature proceeding from, or describing fifteen of these libraries. It would be interesting to know—and I am not here criticizing Dr. Barrow in any way—if there are not some bibliographical publications identified with the other forty-one libraries in London which should be listed in a work of this kind.

There is much work yet to be done in the area of theological bibliography. My own opinion is that we now need, more than anything else in this field, a carefully compiled bibliography of all modern literature pertaining to Bible, theology and religion, covering not only separately printed items, but chapters in books, and especially periodical articles, such as those magnificent bibliographies which have been appearing in Interpretation for the last ten years. Every theological library of any importance, and every library seriously interested in the literature of religion and theology will, of course, consider Dr. Barrow's volume as indispensable. (Incidentally, no address for Dr. Barrow is given in the work itself, but it is included in the advertising material, and in the Cumulative Index—716 Brown Building, Austin, Texas.) Price: $15.00.

LOOKING FORWARD

Our next issue will be devoted almost entirely to Music. We have a couple of excellent bibliographies already prepared. There will be a bit about research in music, and a note about old hymn books.

A bibliography on the Dead Sea Scrolls which will bring Dupont-Somers' work up-to-date, is almost completed, and will be published in the Library Bulletin very soon.

We also have an article on unusual bibliographic and reference tools in preparation which promises to be both informative and readable.